STATE OF ARIZONA
FILED

STATE OF ARIZONA

'JUL 8 1993

DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE

DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE By

In the Matter of
UNITED SERVICES AUTOMOBILE ASSOCIATION
USAA CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY
USAA GENERAL INDEMNITY COMPANY

Docket No. 8141

CONSENT ORDER

Respondents.

A market conduct examination was conducted of the United Services Automobile Association ("USAA"), USAA Casualty Insurance Company ("CIC"), and the USAA General Indemnity Company ("GIC"), hereinafter referred to as "Respondents", by Market Conduct Examiners ("the Examiners") for the Arizona Department of Insurance ("ADOI"). Based on the Report of Market Conduct Examination ("the Report"), it is alleged that Respondents have violated provisions of the Arizona Revised Statutes, Title 20, including Sections 20-220, 20-461, 20-462, 20-1631, 20-1632, 20-1632.01, 20-1652, and 20-1653; Arizona Administrative Code Rule ("A.A.C.R") 4-14-801; and an Order of Director of Insurance of the State of Arizona the ("the Director") --

The Respondent wishes to resolve this matter without formal adjudicative proceedings and hereby agree to a Consent Order.

The Director enters the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, which are neither admitted nor denied by Respondent, and the following Order.

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- 1. Respondent is authorized to transact property and casualty insurance pursuant to Certificates of Authority issued by the Director.
- 2. The Examiners were authorized by the ADOI to conduct a market conduct examination of Respondent. The on-site examination was concluded as of July 10, 1992 and a Report of Examination ("the Report") was written.
- The USAA personal automobile policies reviewed by the Examiners were amended by USAA's "Amendment of Policy Provisions - Arizona", Form Number 5667(06) REV. 6-92 or by USAA's "Amendment of Policy Provisions - Arizona", Form Number 5667(05) REV. 9-88 (hereinafter referred to as the "Endorsement"). Endorsement specifically lists the reasons for which a personal automobile policy may be cancelled or nonrenewed by USAA at Item 4, "TERMINATION", page 2. The reasons listed are the same reasons found in A.R.S. § 20-1631(C) for which an insurer may cancel or nonrenew a policy after the policy has been in effect for sixty (60) days. The Endorsement appeared on six (6) policies which USAA cancelled for reasons other than those listed in the Endorsement and which policies had been in effect for more than sixty (60) days. USAA sent notice of cancellation stating that the policies were being cancelled on these six (6) policies.
- 4. Respondents cancelled seventeen (17) personal automobile policies without offering the named insured the opportunity to exclude from coverage the person other than the named insured whose actions led to policy cancellation.

= 2 -

1 2

3

4 5

6 7

8

9 10

11 12

1314

1516

1718

19

2021

22

23 24

25 26

27

5. Respondents issued 155 notices of cancellation of personal automobile policies which did not include a notice of the named insured's right to complain to the Director of the cancellation within ten days after receipt.

- 6. Respondents issued ninety-nine (99) notices of cancellation of personal automobile policies which did not inform the insureds of their possible eligibility for the automobile assigned risk plan.
- 7. Respondents failed to include refunds of unearned premium with the notices of cancellation of of sixty (60) personal automobile policies which were not financed. These refunds have been made by Respondents to the insureds.
- 8. USAA, routinely, issues a series of premium due statements. Each statement gives a premium due date on which date the policyholder is required to pay his premium to USAA. If the policyholder continues to fail to pay his premium, USAA sends a final statement, together with a Notice of Cancellation. The Notice of Cancellation states in material part:

This is notice to you that the below listed insurance will be cancelled for nonpayment of premium as of the time and date shown ...

If the insured has not paid his premium by the due date stated in the Notice of Cancellation, USAA cancels the policy on the date stated in the Notice of Cancellation and sends no further notice of cancellation. The Examiners found that USAA had cancelled 3,311 policies in this fashion. The policies had all

been in effect more than sixty (60) days. USAA's personal automobile policy states:

We may cancel if the named insured shown in the Declarations fails to pay the premium for this policy or any installment thereof within 7 days after the premium due date.

USAA states that the seven (7) day grace period required by A.R.S. § 20-1632.01(A) is contained within the nineteen (19)-day period provided by USAA's final statement and Notice of Cancellation to the insured.

- 9. Respondents cancelled two (2) residential property policies, #0491148 and 2245715, which had been in effect for at least sixty (60) days for reasons other than those permitted by A.R.S. § 20-1652(A).
- 10. Respondents non-renewed two (2) property policies without giving the insureds notice of the specific facts which constituted the grounds for non-renewal.
- 11. The Examiners found that Respondents had failed to pay the full amount of applicable sales taxes and /or license fees due on 947 of the 2,701 first party automobile total loss claims examined. A total of \$40,931.23 was not paid by Respondents to these claimants.
- 12. In first party total loss claims reviewed, the Examiners found that USAA had taken "make ready" deductions which were in addition to deductions already taken by USAA for the vehicles' conditions. USAA's claim files were silent on the particulars of these "make ready" deductions. It was only from having spoken to USAA personnel that the Examiners learned that

the "make ready" deduction was taken by USAA for the purpose of washing, cleaning, and making the vehicle generally ready for sale. However, these flat deductions ranging in amount from \$25 to \$300 were not supported by documentation in the filing specifically explaining the purpose of the deduction and stating what services and/or activities were included in the "make ready" charge.

- 15. Respondents failed to pay the 1,635 first party total loss claims cited in the above two paragraphs within thirty (30) days after the receipt of an acceptable proof of loss which contained all information necessary for claim adjudication, and did not pay interest thereon. Respondents also failed to pay an additional thirty-two (32) first party total loss claims within thirty (30) days after the receipt of an acceptable proof of loss which contained all information necessary for claim adjudication, and did not pay interest thereon.
- 16. Respondents failed to complete their investigation of nineteen (19) first party automobile total loss claims within thirty (30) days after notification of the claims and did not show that the examinations could not reasonably have been completed that thirty (30) day period.
- 17. In one hundred and fifty-two (152) instances where claimants retained the salvage of their total loss vehicles, Respondents deducted the salvage value of the vehicle from the total and determined the sales taxes due on the basis of this "net" amount, rather than paying sales taxes to claimants based upon the value of the total loss.

1. USAA's action of cancelling automobile policies for reasons other than those permitted by Arizona law violates A.R.S. § 20-1631(C)(3).

2. A.R.S. § 20-1631(D) states in material part:

The company shall not cancel or fail to renew the insurance when a person other than the named insured has violated subsection B, paragraph 3 if the named insured in writing agrees to exclude as insured such person by name...

USAA argues that A.R.S. § 20-1631(D) does not explicitly require USAA to offer to exclude a driver, other than the named insured, who has violated Subsection C. The ADOI agrees. However, the ADOI also contends that this Section of the law is rendered meaningless unless an offer is made and believes USAA should make such offers in the future.

- 3. By issuing notices of cancellation of personal automobile policies which did not include a notice of the named insured's right to complain to the Director of the cancellation within ten days after receipt, Respondents violated A.R.S. § 20-1632(A)(1).
- 4. By issuing notices of cancellation of personal automobile policies which did not inform the insureds of their possible eligibility for the automobile assigned risk plan, Respondents violated A.R.S. § 20-1632(A)(2).
- 5. By failing to include refunds of unearned premium with the notices of cancellation of non-financed personal automobile policies, Respondents violated A.R.S. § 20-1632(A)(3).

.

- 6. USAA fails to send a notice of cancellation AFTER its grace period by which notice the policyholder is informed of his right to complain to the Director. Therefore, USAA has violated A.R.S. § 20-1632.01(B).
- 7. By cancelling residential property policies which had been in effect for at least sixty (60) days for reasons other than those permitted by law, Respondents violated A.R.S. § 20-1652(A).
- 8. By non-renewing residential property policies, without giving the insureds notice of the specific facts which constituted the grounds for non-renewal, Respondents violated A.R.S. § 20-1653.
- 9. By failing to pay the full amount of sales taxes and license fees required for the purchase of comparable automobiles to first-party claimants in their settlement of some first-party automobile total loss claims, Respondents violated A.A.C. Rule 4-14-801(H)(1)(b) and A.R.S. § 20-461(A). In addition, USAA also violated the 1984 Order and A.R.S. § 20-220(B).
- 10. By failing to document deviations from the methodology of A.A.C. Rule 4-14-801(H)(1)(a) and (b) in the calculation of ACV of automobiles involved in first party total loss claims, to give particulars of the automobiles' conditions and to make deductions from the ACV which were measurable, discernible, itemized and specified as to dollar amount and appropriate in amount, Respondents violated A.A.C. Rules 4-14-801(H)(1)(c) and (H)(6) and A.R.S. § 20-461(A).
- 11. By failing to pay all first party claims within thirty (30) days of the receipt of an acceptable proof of loss which

contained all information necessary for claim adjudication and by failing to pay interest on the amount due from the date the claim was received by the insurer, Respondents violated A.R.S. § 20-462(A).

- 12. Respondents violated A.A.C. Rule 4-14-801(G) and A.R.S. § 20-461(A)(3) by failing to complete their investigation of claims within thirty (30) days after notification of the claims, where Respondents did not document that investigation could not reasonably be completed within thirty (30) days.
- 13. By failing to pay sales taxes to claimants on the basis of the total ACV of the vehicle, rather than the ACV net of salvage, Respondents violated A.A.C. Rule 4-14-801(H)(1)(b) and A.R.S. § 20-461(A).

ORDER

Respondents having admitted the jurisdiction of the Director to enter the Order set forth herein, having waived the Notice of Hearing, and having consented to the entry of the Order set forth hereinafter, and there being no just reason for delay:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

1. Respondents shall cease and desist from cancelling personal automobile policies for reasons other than those consistent with A.R.S. § 20-1631; from cancelling personal automobile policies without offering the named insureds the opportunity to exclude from coverage the person other than the named insured whose actions led to policy cancellation; from failing to include within all personal auto policy cancellation notices a notice of the named insureds' right to complain to the

Director of the cancellation and notice of possible eligibility for the assigned risk plan; from failing to include refunds of all notices of cancellation unearned premium with non-financed personal auto policies; from cancelling residential property policies which have been in effect for at least sixty (60) days for reasons other than those permitted by A.R.S. § 20-1652(A); from failing to notify insureds of the specific which constitute the reasons for non-renewal residential property policies; from failing to pay the full amount of applicable sales taxes due on first-party personal automobile claims; from failing to follow orders of the Director; from failing to support vehicle ACV in first-party automobile total claims loss with documentation giving particulars of the automobile's condition or documenting that the settlement amount is determined by the value of a comparable automobile in the market area or by utilizing two (2) dealer available; from failing to pay quotes when interest first-party claims not paid within thirty (30) days after the acceptable proofs loss which of contain receipt of all information necessary for claim adjudication; from failing to complete the investigation of claims within thirty (30) days after notification thereof, unless the investigation cannot reasonably be completed within that time; and from making payments of sales taxes to claimants on first party total losses which do not include the value of salvage retained by the insured.

2. Within sixty (60) days of the filed date of this Order, Respondents shall file with the ADOI for approval amended

copies of their personal auto policy cancellation form letters which include the provisions required by A.R.S. § 20-1632(A)(1), (2), and (3).

- 3. Within sixty (60) days of this Order's filed date, Respondents shall submit to the Director written action plans to provide ongoing training of all personal lines underwriters in the cancellation statute provisions of A.R.S. §§ 20-1631, 20-1632, 20-1632.01, 20-1652, 20-1653 and 20-1654.
- 4. Respondents shall refund to the 1,109 claimants listed in the Report the full amount of sales taxes and/or license fees not paid on first party total loss claims, totalling \$60,042.44. Included in the above are the 948 claims files cited by the Examiners on Page 16 of the Report and the ten (10) files cited as "concessions" on Page 18 of the Report.
- 5. From and after the filed date of this Order, Respondents shall not deduct the salvage value of the vehicle before paying taxes and fees on a first party total loss claim.
- 6. Respondents shall refund the "make ready" charges to those first party total loss claimants from whose claims USAA deducted these charges and which claims were reviewed by the Examiners.
- 7. Respondents shall pay interest to the 33 claimants listed in Exhibit #15 of the Report on the amount of their claims which was not paid within thirty (30) days of receipt of properly executed proofs of loss giving all information necessary for claim adjudication, at the rate of ten percent (10%) per annum calculated from the date the claim was received by the insurer to the date of repayment.

1

- The payments listed in Paragraphs 4, 5, and 6 shall be The refunds may be made by crediting the account of the insured. A letter acceptable to the Director explaining the reason for the payment shall accompany each payment. insured's account is credited, the letter shall be sent to the insured. A list of payments, giving the name and address of each party to whom payments were made and the date of payment, shall be provided to the ADOI when all payments have been made. The Respondents shall be deemed to have complied with this Order if the Respondents mailed the check to the policyholder's last address on record with USAA and no forwarding address has been provided on returned mail. In the event the check is returned with no forwarding address, the Respondents shall be under no further obligation to locate the policyholder. All payments shall be made within thirty (30) days of the filed date of this Order.
- 9. The ADOI shall be permitted, through authorized representatives, to verify Respondents have fully complied with all requirements of this Order, and the Director may separately order Respondents to comply.
- 10. Ninety (90) days after the filed date of this Order, any premium due notice or billing statement intended by the Respondents to include the seven-day grace period shall include the language contained in Exhibit 1 attached hereto. "Grace period" is defined by A.R.S. § 20-1632.01(D) to mean "the period of time after the premium due date during which the policy remains in force without penalty even though the premium due has not been paid".

Additionally, Respondents shall ninety (90) days after the filed date of this Order send a notice of cancellation or nonrenewal to the policyholder of any motor vehicle insurance policy cancelled or nonrenewed for nonpayment of premium by Respondents after the grace period in the format found in Exhibit 2 attached hereto. Said notice shall include the reasons for cancellation or nonrenewal and indicate the name insured's right to complain to the Director.

- 11. Respondents shall pay a civil penalty of Twenty-Five Thousand Dollars (\$25,000) to the Director for remission to the State Treasurer for deposit in the State General Fund in accordance with A.R.S. §20-220 (B). Said \$25,000 shall be provided to the Hearing Division of the ADOI on or before July 17, 1993.
- 12. The July 10, 1992 Report of Examination, to include any objections to the Report by Respondents, shall be filed with the ADOI.

DATED at Phoenix, Arizona this 8th day of July ,1993.

Susah Gallinger

Director of Insurance



NOTICE OF CANCELLATION FOR NONPAYMENT OF PREMIUM" FILE COPY

WILLIAM \$ KNIGHT 860-B S PANTANO RD

TUCSON AZ 85710-5877



DATE OF NOTICE FEBRUARY 22, 1993

ACCORDING TO OUR RECORDS YOU HAVE NOT PAID YOUR ACCOUNT AS REQUIRED. THIS IS NOTICE TO YOU THAT THE BELOW LISTED INSURANCE WILL BE CANCELLED FOR NONPAYMENT OF PREMIUM AS OF THE TIME AND DATE SHOWN.

EFFECTIVE MARCH 12, 1993 (12:01 AM., STANDARD TIME FOR PROPERTY DESCRIBED)
CIC AUTO POLICY 005126086C 7101 7 92 TOYOTA

Exhibit No. 1

CANCELLATION OF AN AUTO POLICY ALSO TERMINATES ALL COVERAGE FOR ADDITIONAL OR REPLACEMENT VEHICLES. THE POLICY INCLUDED IN THIS NOTICE WILL NEITHER BE CONTINUED NOR RENEWED. ANY RENEWAL DECLARATION OR AMENDMENT PAGES YOU MAY HAVE OR RECEIVE FOR THIS POLICY WILL BE VOID AND WILL NOT PROVIDE YOU WITH INSURANCE PROTECTION. YOU HAVE THE RIGHT TO CONTINUE YOUR COVERAGE IF PAYMENT OF THE AMOUNT DUE IS RECEIVED POSTMARKED ON OR BEFORE THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF CANCELLATION.

HE HE HE RAYMENT BY TO BE OF HER HOUSE BY SELECTION.	\$ 325.87
PLEASE SEE THE ATTROUGH STATEMENT	

THE INFORMATION BELOW IS APPLICABLE TO CANCELLATION OF ARIZONA AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE

YOUR GRACE PERIOD TO PAY THE PREMIUM WILL EXPIRE AND YOUR POLICY WILL BE CANCELLED EFFECTIVE MARCH 12, 1993.

YOU ARE HEREBY ADVISED THAT ARIZONA LAW PROVIDES THAT YOU HAVE THE RIGHT TO OBJECT, WITHIN 10 DAYS OF RECEIPT OF THIS NOTICE, TO THE ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE OF THIS ACTION TAKEN BY THE COMPANY.

I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT I HARED THE ORIGINAL CANCELLATION	MERUNJINADAME
EXACT COPT OF WHICH APPEARS ABOVE, OR	11603
CERTERATE OF MARKS WHICH IS AN IN STREET	FFB 2 4 1993
PERSON MARING ROTICE-	7,000

USAA CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY
USAA BURDING . SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78288

9910-000

USAA CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY

USAA Building - San Antonio, Texas 78288
THE EASY READING AUTO POLICY
DECLARATIONS
CANCELED MAR 12, 1993

\$4550	State 4 4 4				763		KUME			
82		1			700	995	12	60	B6C	7181
POL	CY P	ERICE):	ľ	12:01	A.M.	รรอก	dard	timel	

insured and Address

WILLIAM S KNIGHT 660-B S PAHTAHO RD TUCSON AZ 85719-5877 EXAMPLE

							•	WORL	
$\overline{}$	TRACE RAME	Moder	JOST TIPE	telaca. \$4.50M	MENTIFICATION NUMBER	STON		O	1 .
Z		TENCEL BASE	SED ZD		JT2EL4686H0ZZ7Z37				
				<u>:</u>	land albanium stated by a see a state of				

thicless) described herein is principally garaged at the above address unless otherwise stated to a count school because the above address unless otherwise stated to a count school because the above address unless otherwise stated to a count school because the above address unless otherwise stated to a count school because the above address unless otherwise stated to a count school because the above address unless otherwise stated to be above address.

policy provides ONLY those coverages for which	VEH		VEH		VEH	VEH	
AFLY RES	DEDED	PREMIUM	D=CED	1	0=0=0 FNJCMA	 D=DED	PREMILA \$
CY CANCELED PRO-RATA EFFECTIVE							
TOTAL RETURN	PREMI	มส \$31	1.84				

OUR GRACE PERIOD TO PAY THE PREMIUM EXPIRED AND YOUR POLICY IS CANCELLED 3 INDICATED ABOVE.

DU ARE HEREBY ADVISED THAT ARIZONA LAW PROVIDES THAT YOU HAVE THE RIGHT DOBJECT, WITHIN 10 DAYS OF RECEIPT OF THIS NOTICE TO THE ARIZONA DEPARTMENT FINSURANCE OF THIS ACTION TAKEN BY THE COMPANY.

HE MOTOR VEHICLE DIVISION OF THE ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION AS BEEN NOTIFIED OF THIS COVERAGE CANCELLATION. THE VEHICLE REGISTRATION AY BE SUBJECT TO SUSPENSION.

Exhibit No. 2

EX TOTAL

W TNESS WARREOF, we have coused this policy to be signed by our President and Secretary at San Antonia, Texas, on this date MARCH 29, 1993

1. Respondents United Services Automobile Association, USAA Casualty Insurance Company, and USAA General Indemnity Company have reviewed the foregoing Consent Order.

- 2. Respondents are aware of their right to a hearing at which hearing Respondents may be represented by counsel, present evidence and cross-examine witnesses. Respondent have irrevocably waived their right to such public hearing and to any court appeals relating thereto.
- 3. Respondents admit the jurisdiction of the Director of Insurance, State of Arizona, and consent to the entry of this Consent Order.
- 4. Respondents state that no promise of any kind or nature whatsoever was made to it to induce it to enter into this Consent Order and that it has entered into this Consent Order voluntarily.
- 5. Respondents acknowledge that the acceptance of this Order by the Director of Insurance, State of Arizona, is solely for the purpose of settling this matter against them and does not preclude any other agency or officer of this state or subdivision thereof from instituting other civil or criminal proceedings as may be appropriate now or in the future.

 Assistant

6. Robert L. Hoagland represents that as Vice President he is an officer of Respondents United Services Automobile Association, USAA Casualty Insurance Company, and USAA General Indemnity Company, and that, as such, he is authorized by it to enter into this Consent Order on its behalf.

July 1, 1993

(Date)

122-72 M

UNITED SERVICES AUTOMOBILE ASSOCIATION USAA CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY USAA GENERAL INDEMNITY COMPANY

1 2 3 4 COPY of the foregoing mailed/delivered 8th day of July , 1993, to: 5 6 Sara Begley Hearing Officer 7 *Deloris E. Williamson Assistant Director 8 Rates & Regulations Division Jay Rubin 9 Assistant Director Consumer Affairs & Investigations Division Gary Torticill 10 Assistant Director and Chief Financial Examiner 11 Corporate Affairs & Financial Division DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE 3030 N. 3rd Street, Suite 1100 12 Phoenix, AZ 85012 13 J. Michael Low, Esq. Low & Childers, P.C. 14 1221 East Osborn Road, Suite 104 15 Phoenix, Arizona 85012 Michael Broll, CPCU 16 Executive Director, STate Filings United Services Automobile Association 17 USAA Building San Antonio, Texas 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26

27